

**TAYSIDE AND CENTRAL SCOTLAND TRANSPORT PARTNERSHIP**

Minute of the Meeting of the Tayside and Central Scotland Transport Partnership held in Committee Room 1, 14 City Square, Dundee on Tuesday 16 March 2010 at 10.30am.

Present: Councillor John Whyte (Angus Council); Councillor Dave Bowes (Dundee City Council); Councillors Ann Gaunt and Alan Jack (Perth and Kinross Council); Councillor Colin O'Brien (Stirling Council); Professor Malcolm Horner, Professor Tony Wells, Bill Wright, Doug Fleming and Gavin Roser (Members).

In Attendance: E Guthrie (Director); N Gardiner, M Scott and M Cairns (Tactran); G Taylor (Secretary); G Chree (Angus Council); N Gellatly and E Gourlay (Dundee City Council); A Deans, J Cockburn and C Irons (Perth and Kinross Council); and L Goodfellow (Stirling Council).

Also Attending: Phil Berczuk of Steer Davies Gleave (for Item 7).

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Iain Gaul (Angus Council); Councillors Will Dawson and Brian Gordon (Dundee City Council); Councillor John Kellas (Perth and Kinross Council) and Councillor Jim Thomson (Stirling Council); M Galloway (Dundee City Council) and J Symon (Treasurer).

Councillor Jack, Deputy-Chair, Presiding

**1. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

There were no declarations of interest in terms of the Councillors' Code of Conduct.

**2. MINUTE OF MEETING OF 15 DECEMBER 2009**

The minute of meeting of the Tayside and Central Scotland Transport Partnership of 15 December 2009 was submitted and approved as a correct record with the following amendments:

- (i) Paragraph 5 – Strategic Development Plan – Pam Ewing should read Pam Ewen
- (ii) Paragraph 6(iv) – Freight Action Plan – the word 'bulk' be added to read 'availability of suitably sized bulk shipping' and "information" also be added to clarify the position as follows – 'there was a lack of comprehensive freight volume information'

### **3. MATTERS ARISING**

#### **(i) Strategic Development Plan (Paragraph 5)**

The Director advised that the TAYplan Main Issues Report was to be the subject of formal consultation during May and June and a report on this would be submitted to the next meeting on 15 June 2010.

#### **(ii) Freight Action Plan (Paragraph 6(iv) refers)**

The Director provided an oral update on the position with the Scottish Ferries Review. It was anticipated that a Scottish Government consultation on development of a Scottish Ferries Plan would be launched in early June. It was expected that the Ferries Plan would be completed late 2010/early 2011. A report would be submitted to a future meeting on relevant issues.

#### **(iii) Transport Scotland (Paragraph 13 refers)**

The Director advised that following the last meeting he had written to David Middleton, Chief Executive of Transport Scotland, thanking him for attending the meeting and also reiterating the key issues in relation to the Tay Estuary Rail Study (TERS) on which Transport Scotland comments were awaited. He also advised that information on the TERS Report had been provided to COBRA, who had appointed transport consultancy AECOM to carry out their own study on the opening of Blackford Station. It was also understood that the COBRA petition on re-opening of Blackford was due to be reconsidered by the Parliament's Petitions Committee on 22 April 2010. Councillor A Gaunt recorded thanks to Tactran for the cooperation afforded to COBRA and their consultants on access to the TERS information.

L Goodfellow queried the position regarding A9 improvements and specifically the Keir roundabout. The Director confirmed that a meeting was to be sought with Transport Scotland to discuss the status of this and other Strategic Transport Projects Review proposals in the Tactran region.

Councillor J Whyte questioned if phase 1 of TERS would be in jeopardy if it was not completed by December 2011 and the Director advised this would be clarified with Transport Scotland and an update provided to the next meeting.

#### **4. NON-COUNCILLOR MEMBERS**

There was submitted a report by the Secretary (RTP/10/01) on the position of Non-Councillor Members of the Partnership. G Taylor advised that the term of office for both Professor Malcolm Horner and Mr Bill Wright would expire on 30 April 2010. Bill Wright had indicated he was willing to continue as a Non-Councillor Member of the Partnership and approval was required to replace Professor Horner.

##### **Resolved:**

- (i) Bill Wright's term of office be extended for a further two year period until 30 April 2012 subject to satisfactory appraisal by the Chair of the Partnership in accordance with Scottish Government procedures.
- (ii) The resignation of Professor Malcolm Horner from the position of Non-Councillor Member of the Partnership with effect from 30 April 2010 be noted.
- (iii) A recruitment process be entered into to fill the resultant vacancy and authority be delegated to the Executive Committee to carry out this process in accordance with the arrangements set out in Report RTP/10/01.
- (iv) That Professor Horner would remain on the Executive Committee until such time as the recruitment process for his replacement has been concluded.
- (v) Thanks and appreciation be extended to Professor Horner for his significant contribution to the work of the Partnership since his appointment in April 2006.
- (vi) It be deferred to the next meeting on 15 June 2010 to fill the vacancy on the Executive Committee following the resignation of Professor Horner.

Councillor A Jack and the Director both thanked Professor Horner for his contribution to the Partnership over the past 4 years and wished him well in the future. Professor Horner thanked successive Chairs and all Members for their inclusive approach throughout his time on the Partnership.

#### **5. PARK AND RIDE STRATEGY**

There was submitted a report by the Projects Manager (RTP/10/02) on progress made on various Park and Ride Strategy Projects and seeking authority to engage with relevant stakeholders to progress the conclusions of the study.

N Gardiner provided updated information as follows in respect of the four different Park and Ride Studies:-

- (a) A92 South of Tay Bridge

Transport Scotland were now involved in the Steering Group for this project and were making a financial contribution to the ongoing work. An investigation into the technical feasibility of a Park and Ride site at the landfill site to the south of the B946 was to be undertaken. It was noted that as the St Andrews and East Fife Local Plan did not allocate the landfill site as being suitable for Park and Ride the Director had responded to the Local Plan Consultation which ended on 24

December 2009. The Director submitted a formal objection to the lack of allocation for Park and Ride at this location. SEStran also lodged a formal objection and Dundee City Council had requested this location be considered as an option for Park and Ride. Fife Council were expected to report on the outcome of the Local Plan Consultation prior to their summer recess. Professor Horner queried if it was known why Fife Council had not allowed an allocation of ground for Park and Ride and N Gardiner advised that they had identified the alternative Forgan roundabout site but that Planners also had concerns regarding the visual impact of a Park and Ride scheme on the landfall site referred to.

(b) A90 Dundee West Park and Ride

N Gardiner advised that work was ongoing in developing this scheme. He advised it had progressed through the various stages of appraisal, firstly reducing the thirteen sites initially considered at the pre-appraisal stage, down to seven sites for initial appraisal and two locations would now be considered for detailed appraisal. The locations were (1) at the Swallow/Landmark roundabout which could incorporate a left-hand lane on the A90 to provide access and (2) Riverside Avenue at Wright Avenue.

Councillor Whyte questioned if a Park and Ride Scheme at the Riverside location would interfere with the proposed work relating to the relocation of Invergowrie Train Station and N Gardiner advised that it would in fact complement it with the provision of car parking close by.

(c) A90 East of Perth Park and Ride

N Gardiner confirmed that two sites that had been identified in the Tactran Park and Ride Strategy were appraised. Following a technical feasibility one site was discarded due to the access / egress arrangements therefore only one site at Walnut Grove was taken forward for more detailed analysis and appraisal.

The central forecast demand was set at 159 vehicles per day in 2012 rising to 182 in 2031. This included an estimated 49 vehicles per day abstracted from the existing Broxden Park and Ride site.

Three scenarios for bus operations were considered to provide a fifteen minute frequency to the city centre.

Overall the project's Capital cost was estimated at approximately £1.5m including Optimism Bias. If overnight lorry parking was to be accommodated an additional cost of £375,000 would be required.

It was noted the annual bus service subsidy could range between £50,000 to £120,000 depending on whether it was a hybrid bus service

or a dedicated bus service and that this cost was comparable with other similar schemes.

Against the cost implications other issues should be considered such as the wider economic benefits through an improved image and attractiveness for tourists and visitors, released pressure at the Broxden site with some drivers transferring to the new site and also the reduction of traffic in the town centre. N Gardiner concluded that the development of this Park and Ride proposal should be incorporated into the Perth Area Transport Study (PATS) for all benefits to be evaluated.

Councillor O'Brien queried why provision for 240 car parking spaces with space for future expansion was required when the capacity studies indicated demand for only 160 spaces. N Gardiner advised that the forecasts were calculated in accordance with the Park and Ride Strategy document which looked at passby traffic. He added that 159 vehicles was the mid-range forecast which could be higher or lower and the figure was factored up on traffic growth road predictions. Also the PATS and associated City Centre Parking Strategy could change the balance of demand for parking in the city centre and for Park and Ride. N Gardiner added that Broxden had required significant expansion and it was preferable to plan for future expansion at any new site. Councillor O'Brien queried why lorries could not use the area as it was, without additional expenditure and N Gardiner advised that stronger surfacing would be required to accommodate lorry parking. In response to a query regarding the projected bus subsidy, the Director advised that the options for bus service delivery would be discussed with operators, with a view to exploring opportunities for private/public sector partner funding.

Councillor Gaunt stated that the Broxden Park and Ride was a great success which had required expansion and there had been the spin-off of a bus service to Perth Royal Infirmary.

Professor Horner added that as well as an economic appraisal an environmental appraisal was also required. N Gardiner confirmed the STAG process takes account of other aspects, including an environmental appraisal, in addition to economic costs and benefits.

D Fleming referred to the additional expenditure required to accommodate lorries and queried whether this could generate income to offset the cost and also whether the 333 bus service to the hospital would also stop at the new Park and Ride Site. N Gardiner advised that arrangements could be made for this as it travels between Perth and Ninewells Hospital. B Wright referred to a press report today indicating that petrol prices were to increase significantly and asked if pedestrian and cycle provision were still to be included in the Park and Ride schemes. N Gardiner confirmed these were included.

G Roser questioned the effect on numbers using the Park and Ride if the Government were to decide the cost of free bus passes could not be sustained and N Gardiner agreed this would affect numbers but the scheme would have to be based on current information.

(d) South of Stirling Park and Ride

N Gardiner advised that this project had started at the end of December / early January and surveys had now been undertaken. Ten initial locations had been reduced to seven and from the initial appraisal that was almost complete it appeared likely that three locations would be taken forward to detailed appraisal.

**Resolved:**

- (i) The progress on the four Park and Ride studies as detailed within Report RTP/10/02 be noted.
- (ii) The Director's response to the St Andrews and East Fife Local Plan Consultation as detailed in Appendix A to Report RTP/10/02 be endorsed.
- (iii) Reports on the outcomes of the A90 Dundee West and Stirling South Park and Ride Studies be submitted to the next meeting.
- (iv) The conclusions for the A90 East of Perth Park and Ride Study as outlined in Report RTP/10/02 be approved.
- (v) It be remitted to officers to progress the development of the proposals within the A90 East of Perth Park and Ride Study with all relevant stakeholders.

**6. DEMAND RESPONSIVE TRANSPORT**

There was submitted a report by the Strategy Manager (RTP/10/03) updating the Partnership on progress on implementing an Urban Demand Responsive Transport (DRT) pilot scheme in Dundee and on investigating the feasibility of a rural DRT pilot in west Kinross-shire and DRT options for Forth Valley Royal Hospital. The Director advised that a report to be submitted to Dundee City Council's Development Committee on 22 March 2010 had been deferred to the meeting on 26 April 2010 to allow further discussion and the setting up of a legal agreement. He also advised that the surveys undertaken in relation to the rural DRT pilot had been delayed due to the severe winter weather. He added that Tactran was continuing to work with SEStran on a study into the scope for improving access to the Forth Valley Royal Hospital at Larbert.

D Fleming commented that, based on previous experience of DRT, it was important to discuss proposals with the Scottish Traffic Commissioner's office from an early stage and prior to submitting service proposals for her approval. M Cairns confirmed Dundee City Council had made contact with the Commissioner. N Gellatly agreed to arrange for John Berry, the officer leading on DRT in Dundee City, to contact D Fleming to discuss the scheme and benefit from his experience.

Councillor O'Brien highlighted the experience of operating DRT services in the Stirling area that the Council would be willing to share their experience. The Director confirmed that the purpose of the DRT pilots was to enable sharing of best practice and that input from relevant officers in Stirling would be welcomed.

**Resolved:**

- (i) Progress in implementing the urban DRT pilot in Dundee be noted.
- (ii) Progress in investigation into the detailed feasibility of a rural DRT pilot in West Kinross-shire in partnership with Perth and Kinross Council be noted.
- (iii) A report on investigation into DRT options for Forth Valley Royal Hospital be submitted to a future meeting.

**7. TRAVEL INFORMATION STRATEGY**

There was submitted a report by the Projects Manager (RTP/10/04) providing an update on progress in implementing priorities as set out in the Travel Information Strategy and seeking the Partnership's agreement to launch a Regional Travel Information Gateway website. Phil Berczuk of Steer Davies Gleave, who had assisted in developing a regional web based portal covering all relevant travel information sources gave a presentation on the Tactran Connect portal. The website combined existing data sources on one site for easier access and therefore required no additional resource input from partner agencies. There were links to bus and rail timetables as well as station locations and information on planning a car journey, lift-sharing, walking, cycling, taxis and air travel. The website was aimed at engaging a wider audience than individual local websites through the range of multi-modal information provided. Any future additional links can be easily integrated.

The Director advised that the contract to develop the website would be completed at the end of March and that it was intended to launch the facility through a comprehensive promotional campaign, including radio advertisement. He also referred to the significant added value of the site with little or no additional burden either through additional work or costs for partner agencies. L Goodfellow asked what evaluation would be undertaken to ensure value for money and that strategic objectives were being met. P Berczuk advised that tools such as Google Analytics would be added and that other formal monitoring could also be added. M Scott advised that travel habit surveys which were currently undertaken asked if users were aware of the Liftshare Website and this could be adapted to incorporate reference to Tactran Connect.

**Resolved:**

- (i) Progress in implementing priority actions as set out in the Travel Information Strategy be noted.
- ii) The launch of a regional travel Information Gateway website [www.tactranconnect.com](http://www.tactranconnect.com) be approved.
- (iii) To endorse the appointment of Steer Davies Gleave to develop the website at a cost of £20,000.

## **8. 2009/10 REVENUE MONITORING**

There was submitted a joint report by the Director and Treasurer (RTP/10/05) providing an update on Revenue expenditure for 2009/10 as committed and projected at 31 January 2010. The report also sought the Partnership's endorsement of re-profiling of expenditure to maximise spend by the end of the Financial Year. J Cockburn referred to the details shown in Appendices A, B and C to Report RTP/10/05 which included the re-allocation of budget and underspends. He added that it was proposed that any underspend would be returned to the relevant Councils following the Audit of Accounts.

### **Resolved:**

- (i) The projected Core Revenue Budget outturn position for financial year 2009/10 as detailed in Appendix A to Report RTP/10/05 be noted.
- (ii) The projected Travel Plan Budget outturn position for financial year 2009/10 as detailed in Appendix B to Report RTP/10/05 be noted.
- (iii) The progress on the 2009/10 RTS Revenue Programme projects as detailed within Report RTP/10/05 be noted.
- (iv) The re-profiling of Revenue expenditure in 2009/10 as detailed in Report RTP/10/05 and also Appendix C thereto be endorsed.

## **9. 2010/11 REVENUE BUDGET**

There was submitted a joint report by the Director and Treasurer (RTP/10/06) providing an update on the Partnership's Revenue funding for financial year 2010/11 and seeking approval of initial allocations of Revenue expenditure. The Director noted that Tactran's main source of funding was Scottish Government Grant in Aid plus contributions towards the Core Revenue Budget from each partner Council, based upon an agreed formula. The 2010/11 Core Revenue Budget contributions had been agreed by each partner Council in February 2010.

The Director referred to the provisional allocation of funding towards projects in support of the Regional Transport Strategy during 2010/11, as previously approved by the Partnership at its meeting on 23 June 2009. He advised that this programme would be reviewed and updated in light of progress on individual RTS Project headings and upon receipt of confirmation of the level of 2010/11 Scottish Government Grant in Aid funding. In the meantime it was proposed that £30,000 of the provisional allocation of £75,000 for Travel Planning activity be allocated to a proposed project working collaboratively with the TPi Consultancy on the development of a web based Travel Plan implementation toolkit. M Scott, Travel Plan Officer was currently in discussion with TPi on this and it was envisaged that the proposed toolkit would be particularly beneficial in supporting the Travel Plan Officer's work on promoting and supporting the development of Travel Planning with other agencies.

It was proposed that a further £15,000 from a presently Unallocated amount of £49,000 be allocated to supporting development of the Travel Information Strategy, including the tactranconnect website.

Councillor O'Brien queried the inclusion of funding for development of a Regional Transport Model and indicated that there were some concerns regarding this proposal. The Director advised that the allocations set out in the Table in section 3.3 of the report were provided for information only and remained indicative, as approved by the Partnership on 23 June 2009. These allocations would be reviewed in consultation with Council officers and in light of confirmed Scottish Government Grant in Aid funding, and an updated 2010/11 Revenue Programme would be reported for approval by the Partnership at its next meeting on 15 June 2010.

**Resolved:**

- (i) The position regarding anticipated Revenue funding contributions for 2010/11, as set out in Report RTP/10/06 be noted.
- (ii) Suspension of Financial Regulation 22 be agreed and authority be delegated to the Director and Treasurer to approve the award of a contract to TPi for the development of a web-based Travel Planning toolkit at a cost of up to £30,000.
- (iii) An initial allocation of £15,000 towards supporting development of Travel Information Strategy initiatives in 2010/11 be approved.
- (iv) A report on a detailed 2010/11 Revenue Programme utilising anticipated Scottish Government Grant in Aid be submitted to the next meeting on 15 June 2010.

**10. CAPITAL PROGRAMME MONITORING**

There was submitted a report by the Projects Manager (RTP/10/07) on progress in implementing the 2009/10 - 2010/11 Tactran Capital Programme.

Professor Horner queried if there were funds available for other projects due to delays in the improved road links to Dundee Port. N Gardiner confirmed that the programme allowed £400,000 in 2010/11 with further expenditure of £1,773,000 carried over into 2011/12 and added that the project depended on the Port Authority and also Network Rail due to works over the railway line. Professor Horner queried if other work could be brought forward with the Port Authority work now being delayed. The Director advised that arrangement for management of slippage within Council Capital Programmes had already been put in place, as reported in previous Capital monitoring reports and that these arrangements could not be altered without agreement of the Councils.

**Resolved:**

- (i) Progress on implementing the Tactran 2009/10 – 2010/11 Capital Programme and the projected outturn position as detailed in Report RTP/10/07 be noted.
- (ii) The re-profiling of Capital expenditure in 2009/10 – 2010/11 as detailed in Report RTP/10/07 be approved.

- (iii) Progress on implementing the relevant Angus Council and Stirling Council Capital Programmes, as detailed in Appendices B and C to Report RTP/10/07 be noted.

PROFESSOR HORNER LEFT THE MEETING AT THIS POINT.

## **11. CONSULTATIONS**

There was submitted a report by the Strategy Manager (RTP/10/08) seeking the Partnership's endorsement of an officer response to consultation by East Coast Main Line on its proposed train timetable. Approval was also sought for proposed responses to Nestrans' consultation on their Rail Action Plan, a Department for Transport consultation on the Inter-City East Coast Franchise and a Royal Society of Edinburgh Inquiry into Facing up to Climate Change.

Delegated authority was also sought to respond on Angus Council's Public Transport Policy Statement and to Loch Lomond and the Trossachs National Parks Finalised Draft Local Plan.

### **Resolved:**

- (i) The Officers submission to the East Coast Main Line consultation as detailed in Appendix A to Report RTP/10/08 be endorsed.
- (ii) The proposed response to Nestrans' consultation on their Rail Action Plan as detailed in Appendix B be approved.
- (iii) The proposed response to the Department for Transport's consultation on the Inter-City East Coast Franchise as detailed in Appendix C be approved.
- (iv) The proposed response to the Royal Society of Edinburgh's Inquiry into Facing up to Climate Change as detailed in Appendix D to Report RTP/10/08 be approved.
- (v) Authority be delegated to the Director to respond to Angus Council's Public Transport Policy Statement and Loch Lomond and the Trossachs National Park's Finalised Draft Local Plan.

G CHREE LEFT DURING DISCUSSION OF THE ABOVE ITEM.

## **12. DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

There was submitted a report by the Director (RTP/10/09) updating the Partnership on various matters of interest and relevance to the work of the Partnership. The Director advised that the Draft Annual Report had been submitted to Executive Committee Members for comment and would be published and distributed in the near future. He added that the Joint RTP Chairs/CoSLA Transport Strategy Group meeting scheduled for 19 March 2010 had been postponed to allow further discussion on alternative funding opportunities and would now be held late May/early June. With regard to High Speed Rail (HSR) he advised that a response was awaited from the Department of Transport and referred to the UK Transport Minister's statement on 11 March 2010 regarding HSR to the Midlands and beyond to the Central Belt of Scotland, adding that there were now three suggested options for HSR connectivity north of the Midlands. In each case the overall

benefits of ensuring that HSR extended to Scotland were acknowledged. It was understood that the Transport Scotland Working Group set up to develop the Business Case for HSR extending to Scotland would be continued and further progress on this would be reported to future meetings.

B Wright expressed concern that there were various options being developed for HSR and added that there was no need to halve the train journey time to compete with air travel, but there was a need for attractive pricing. The Director advised that the various options indicated journey times ranging between three hours twenty minutes to two hours thirty minutes and that all studies recognised the significantly enhanced environmental benefits of extending HSR to Scotland as a result of the greater potential for modal shift from air to rail.

On Strategic Freight Issues it was noted that the work which had been undertaken through the Tactran Freight Quality Partnership would complement similar work being undertaken by SPT and SEStran and would help inform the national case for development of regional freight consolidation centres.

G Roser requested that in-depth discussion be held with stakeholders on freight consolidation to ensure they were aware of the proposals and benefits. M Cairns advised that there had been wide ranging consultation with retailers in Dundee and Perth at the end of last year regarding their distribution arrangements and existing issues and problems, to then gauge opinions on a consolidation centre. A report on this would be submitted to a future meeting.

The Director also referred to engagement with the Confederation of Passenger Transport (CPT) and seven key areas/priorities that had been identified for further discussion/investigation between the Regional Transport Partnerships (RTPs) and CPT. One of these was the development of Salary Sacrifice schemes to encourage the use of public transport. However, HMRC had recently adopted a more rigid interpretation of the rules relating to Salary Sacrifice which would affect such schemes. The RTP Chairs had agreed to write to the Department for Transport and Treasury to request a review of this position as the change in application of the rules had already led to some schemes being withdrawn and others were likely to be affected.

**PROFESSOR WELLS LEFT THE MEETING AT THIS POINT.**

G Roser referred to global issues and an international logistic report which he agreed to forward to the Director.

### **13. DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

It was noted that the next meeting would be held on Tuesday 15 June 2010 in Perth.

Councillor Jack advised that, in line with previous decisions regarding 2010/11 Budget savings, the Tactran office would be taking over the distribution of Committee papers from the Committee Section at Perth and Kinross Council with effect from April 2010. The Director thanked all Committee staff for the service and support provided to the Partnership Board, Members and Tactran staff since December 2005.