

TAYSIDE AND CENTRAL SCOTLAND TRANSPORT PARTNERSHIP

23 JUNE 2009

DEMAND RESPONSIVE TRANSPORT

REPORT BY DIRECTOR

This report updates the Partnership on work undertaken into identifying urban and rural DRT pilot areas and seeks approval for further development of the urban DRT pilot in Dundee. Further work on rural options will be reported to a future meeting.

1 RECOMMENDATIONS

1.1 That the Partnership:-

- (i) notes the DRT Pilot Area Selection Report;
- (ii) approves the selection of the urban DRT pilot in Dundee and further investigation into the development of DRT in partnership with Dundee City Council; and
- (iii) receives a future report following further development of rural DRT options.

2 BACKGROUND

- 2.1 The Regional Transport Strategy (RTS) under the strategic theme Connecting Communities & Being Socially Inclusive includes a proposal to maximise the role and contribution of Community and Demand Responsive Transport in improving general accessibility and social inclusion.
- 2.2 At its meeting on 28 October 2008 the Partnership endorsed a contribution of £29,000 towards an extension of the Buses and CT/DRT sub-strategy work to consider feasibility of an Urban and Rural Demand Responsive Transport (DRT) pilot (Report RTP/08/30 refers). This took account of interest expressed by Dundee City Council in investigating the scope for piloting urban DRT solutions within the City, as part of an "in-house" review of their existing pilot DRT and TaxiCard schemes.
- 2.3 Consultants Steer Davies Gleave (SDG) were appointed to develop proposals for the DRT pilots, with a view to the study being completed and informing consideration of options for implementation of pilot projects before the end of the financial year. The appointed Project Director and Project Manager both left the employment of SDG towards the end of 2008, resulting in the need to appoint a new project team, with consequential delays in completion of the project. The new project team commenced work in late January and has reported on the urban and rural pilot area selection. A copy of the report is available on the Members Section of the Tactran website: <http://www.tactran.gov.uk/members/documents/DRTPilotAreaSelectionReport.pdf>

3 DISCUSSION

- 3.1 SDG was commissioned to carry out a feasibility study for potential DRT pilot schemes in both rural and urban areas of the Tactran region. A detailed review was undertaken of the role played by DRT, the characteristics of different types of DRT and the types of DRT markets. To assist with the selection of appropriate pilot areas the consultants considered the relevant RTS and Buses Strategy Objectives and from these developed Planning Objectives, which are listed in Appendix A.
- 3.2 The consultants reviewed evidence of demand for DRT that was gathered in the development of the Buses Strategy. This was supplemented with additional data to identify areas for a pilot DRT scheme. Key to the analysis has been the application of the Accession accessibility model. This has enabled the identification of gaps in the public transport network and potential areas for demand for DRT, both geographically and by population type. Potential urban areas have been identified for Dundee and Perth. Rural areas identified, together with the Council areas in which they are located, are as follows:
- Killin, Tyndrum (Stirling)
 - Aberfoyle, Strathard, Drymen & National Park Boundaries (Stirling)
 - Angus Glens (Angus)
 - Crieff, Auchterarder, Aberdalgie-Perth, Kinbuck-Braco (Perth & Kinross, Stirling)
 - Pitlochry, Aberfeldy, Dunkeld (Perth & Kinross)
 - Strathmore East – area bounded by Forfar, Brechin and Montrose (Angus)
 - Strathmore West – area bounded by Blairgowrie, Coupar Angus, Forfar and Kirriemuir (Angus, Perth & Kinross)
 - Trossachs, Aberfoyle, Callander (Stirling).
- 3.3 An appraisal has been undertaken of the potential pilot areas to evaluate the extent to which each area performs against a set of key criteria, as follows :-
- fit with Buses Strategy objectives and actions
 - demand / Market – where the need for DRT has been identified
 - capacity to build on – to what extent existing organisational capacity and infrastructure would ease the introduction of a pilot
 - financial – commentary on financial factors such as current budgetary pressures and potential funding opportunities
 - public acceptability – commentary on issues around public acceptability of DRT in the pilot area
 - transferability – the extent to which the area is “typical” of the Tactran region, to assist with the roll-out of DRT schemes to other parts of the region using lessons learnt from the pilots
 - authority boundary benefits – commentary on whether the potential pilot area generates individual or cross-boundary benefits.
- 3.4 The results of the appraisal are shown in Appendix B. The analysis indicates that, of the two possible urban pilot areas, Dundee has a better fit with Buses Strategy Actions, Demand/Market and Public Acceptability. It is, therefore, proposed that this is the subject of further detailed development in partnership with Dundee City Council. Detailed consideration needs to be given to integration with existing pilot DRT and TaxiCard schemes, financial and

operational issues, procurement processes and possible competition with commercial operations, particularly taxis and private hire vehicles

- 3.5 In terms of the potential rural pilots the areas with the best fit with the key criteria are Aberfoyle, Strathard, Drymen & National Park Boundaries; Crieff, Auchterarder, Aberdalgie-Perth, Kinbuck-Braco; and Strathmore West. Discussions with Council officers have indicated that further work is required to clarify a number of issues before recommending the selection of the rural pilot area. These include consideration of competition with existing public transport, including taxis and private hire vehicles; procurement processes; and resources, both in terms of staff and financial support. There is also a need to ensure fit with current Council policies and initiatives with regard to DRT.

4 CONSULTATIONS

- 4.1 This report has been prepared in consultation with the Public Transport Officers Liaison Group and the Chief Officers Liaison Group who are in agreement with the proposals.
- 4.2 It is proposed to undertake stakeholder consultation on the detailed proposals and arrangements for implementation of DRT pilots through the Regional Buses and CT/DRT Forum, prior to progressing implementation.

5 RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 Funding for initial work undertaken by the consultants in financial year 2008/09 was met from the RTS Implementation Budget. A remaining balance of £21,000 to complete the development of the DRT pilot options in 2009/10 requires to be met from the proposed Revenue Programme, which forms a separate report. A further sum of £10,000 is being contributed by Dundee City Council.

Eric Guthrie
Director

Report prepared by Michael Cairns. For further information contact email michaelcairns@tactran.go.uk or tel. 01738 475774

NOTE

Background papers, as defined by Section 50D of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973 (and not containing confidential or exempt information) which were relied on to a material extent in preparing the above Report :-

Tactran DRT Pilot Feasibility Study Pilot Area Selection Report

Reports to Partnership on 28 October 2008 and 10 March 2009 on 2008-09 Revenue Budget Monitoring

Planning Objectives for DRT Pilot areas

| Urban | Rural |
|--|--|
| 1. To serve unmet need where more appropriate alternatives cannot meet this need effectively | 1. To serve unmet need where more appropriate alternatives cannot meet this need effectively |
| 2. To serve existing “met” need more effectively and efficiently | 2. To serve existing “met” need more effectively and efficiently |
| 3. To build on existing capacity where appropriate | 3. To build on existing capacity where appropriate |
| 4. To improve accessibility of specified groups and / or to specified destinations | 4. To improve general accessibility of rural communities, and in particular to health, employment, education and leisure/tourism |
| 5. To feed into conventional passenger transport services | 5. To feed into conventional passenger transport services |

APPENDIX B

Appraisal of Potential DRT Pilot Areas

Unshaded indicates strong performance against criteria, shaded has a moderate performance.

| | Dundee city | Perth city | Killin, Tyndrum | Aberfoyle, Strathard, Drymen & National Park Boundaries | Angus Glens | Crieff, Auchterarder, Aberdalgie- Perth, Kinbuck- Braco | Pitlochry, Aberfeldy, Dunkeld | Strathmore East | Strathmore West | Trossachs, Aberfoyle, Callander |
|--|---|---|---|---|---|--|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| Fit with Buses Strategy Objectives | Obj 1,2,3,9,11 | Obj 1,2,3,9,11 | Obj 2,3,5,8,9,11 | Obj 2,3,5,8,9,11 | Obj 2,3,5,8,9, 11 | Obj 1,2,3,5,8,9,11 | Obj 2,3,5,8,9,11 | Obj 1,2,3,8,9,11 | Obj 1,2,3,5,8,9, 11 | Obj 2,3,5,8,9,11 |
| Fit with Buses Strategy Actions | NC1, NC3, NC4, IV7 | NC1, NC4 | NC2, NP9, IV9 | NC2, NP9, IV9 | NC2 | NC2 | NC2 | NC2 | NC2 | NC2, NP9, IV9 |
| Demand / Market | Perceived significant unmet demand amongst elderly and disabled; good PT | Some potential demand linking to mainstream bus; limited demand for taxicard | Rural accessibility in general, including visitors for leisure | Rural accessibility in general, including visitors for leisure | Rural accessibility in general, including visitors for leisure | Rural accessibility in general, perceived demand for social/ leisure opportunities/ intra-town/ | Rural accessibility in general | Rural accessibility in general | Rural accessibility in general, including visitors for leisure | Rural accessibility in general, including visitors for leisure |

| | Dundee city | Perth city | Killin, Tyndrum | Aberfoyle, Strathard, Drymen & National Park Boundaries | Angus Glens | Crieff, Auchterarder, Aberdalgie- Perth, Kinbuck- Braco | Pitlochry, Aberfeldy, Dunkeld | Strathmore East | Strathmore West | Trossachs, Aberfoyle, Callander |
|-------------------------|--|--|---|---|---|---|--|---|--|---|
| | network | transport | | | | village transport | | | | |
| Capacity to build on | Some CT (DCT), although limited; multiple taxi operators including one already contracted for Taxicard; private bus operator operating Friendly Bus initiative | Some, CT umbrella group (PKCTG) and other CT operators; taxi operators; private bus sector with suitable vehicles | Significant (Stirling DAR central booking); small no. of local taxi operators | Significant (Stirling DAR central booking); small no. of local taxi operators However, being rolled out as DRT pilot by Stirling Council in any case | Significant existing infrastructure (ATF) | Some, CT umbrella group (PKCTG) and other CT operators; taxi operators; private bus sector with suitable vehicles | Some, CT umbrella group (PKCTG) and other CT operators; taxi operators; private bus sector with suitable vehicles | Significant existing infrastructure (ATF) | Significant (ATF & PKCTG, other CT operators); local taxi operators; private bus operators | Significant (Stirling DAR central booking); small no. of local taxi operators |
| Financial | Budgetary pressure on alternatives (Taxicard | RTS funding may be available for pilot. P&KC | RTS funding may be available for pilot | RTS funding may be available for pilot | RTS funding may be available for pilot. P&KC | RTS funding may be available for pilot P&KC | RTS funding may be available for pilot. P&KC | Budgetary pressure on Taxicard RTS funding | RTS funding may be available for pilot. P&KC | RTS funding may be available for pilot |

| | Dundee city | Perth city | Killin, Tyndrum | Aberfoyle, Strathard, Drymen & National Park Boundaries | Angus Glens | Crieff, Auchterarder, Aberdalgie- Perth, Kinbuck- Braco | Pitlochry, Aberfeldy, Dunkeld | Strathmore East | Strathmore West | Trossachs, Aberfoyle, Callander |
|----------------------|---|---|---|---|---------------------------------|--|-------------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------------|---|
| | and supported bus services), funding to be reallocated RTS funding may be available for pilot | may have small fund for DRT/CT. | Budgetary pressure on high cost supported bus services, budget could be reallocated | Budgetary pressure on high cost supported bus services, budget could be reallocated | may have small fund for DRT/CT. | may have small fund for DRT/CT. | may have small fund for DRT/CT. | may be available for pilot | may have small fund for DRT/CT. | Budgetary pressure on high cost supported bus services, budget could be reallocated |
| Public acceptability | Pressure from communities for DRT; potential competition issues with taxis although dependent on market | Potential competition issues with taxis although dependent on market served | May be popular if replacing a cut supported bus service | May be popular if replacing a cut supported bus service | No issues known | May be popular if can benefit a number of community groups | No issues known | No issues known | No issues known | May be popular if replacing a cut supported bus service |

| | Dundee city | Perth city | Killin, Tyndrum | Aberfoyle, Strathard, Drymen & National Park Boundaries | Angus Glens | Crieff, Auchterarder, Aberdalgie- Perth, Kinbuck- Braco | Pitlochry, Aberfeldy, Dunkeld | Strathmore East | Strathmore West | Trossachs, Aberfoyle, Callander |
|-----------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------------|--|--|--|--|---|--|---|--|
| | served | | | | | | | | | |
| Transferability | Comparable only to Perth | Comparable only to Dundee | Comparable to other remote rural areas | Comparable to other remote rural areas | Comparable to other remote rural areas | Comparable to rural and small towns areas | Comparable to rural and small towns areas | Comparable to other remote rural areas | Comparable to rural and small towns areas | Comparable to other remote rural areas |
| Authority boundary benefits | Dundee only | Perth & Kinross Only | Stirling only | Stirling only – although includes National Park | Angus only | Stirling and Perth & Kinross | Perth & Kinross only | Angus only | Perth & Kinross and Angus | Stirling only |